

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ALABAMA SOUTHERN DIVISION

ELIZABETH BROWN,)
Plaintiff,))
v.)))
MIDLAND FUNDING LLC, a corporation;) case 110. 2.10-cv-01254-71KiX
TRANS UNION LLC, a corporation; and	,)
EXPERIAN INFORMATION)
SOLUTIONS, INC., a corporation,)
Defendants.)))

ANSWER AND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES OF DEFENDANT EXPERIAN INFORMATION SOLUTIONS, INC.

COMES NOW Defendant Experian Information Solutions, Inc. ("Experian"), by its undersigned counsel, and in answer to the Complaint, states as follows:

PARTIES

- 1. In response to paragraph 1 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.
- 2. In response to paragraph 2 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.

- 3. In response to paragraph 3 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.
- 4. In response to paragraph 4 of the Complaint, Experian admits that it is an Ohio corporation, with its principal place of business in Costa Mesa, California. Experian further admits that it is qualified to do business and does conduct business in the State of Alabama. Except as specifically admitted, Experian denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation of paragraph 4 of the Complaint.

FACTUAL ALLEGATIONS

- 5. In response to paragraph 5 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.
- 6. In response to paragraph 6 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.
- 7. In response to paragraph 7 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.

8. In response to paragraph 8 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.

9. In response to paragraph 9 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.

10. In response to paragraph 10 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.

- 11. In response to paragraph 11 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.
- 12. In response to paragraph 12 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.

13. In response to paragraph 13 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.

14. In response to paragraph 14 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.

15. In response to paragraph 15 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.

- 16. In response to paragraph 16 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.
- 17. In response to paragraph 17 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.

18. In response to paragraph 18 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.

19. In response to paragraph 19 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.

- 20. In response to paragraph 20 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.
- 21. In response to paragraph 21 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.
- 22. In response to paragraph 22 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.

- 23. In response to paragraph 23 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.
- 24. In response to paragraph 24 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.
- 25. In response to paragraph 25 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.
- 26. In response to paragraph 26 of the Complaint, Experian denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein that relates to Experian. As to the allegations in paragraph 26 of the Complaint that relate to the other defendants, Experian does not have knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of those allegations and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation of paragraph 26 of the Complaint.
- 27. In response to paragraph 27 of the Complaint, Experian denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein that relates to Experian. As to the allegations in paragraph 27 of the Complaint that relate to the other defendants, Experian does not have knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the

truth of those allegations and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation of paragraph 27 of the Complaint.

- 28. In response to paragraph 28 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.
- 29. In response to paragraph 29 of the Complaint, Experian denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein that relates to Experian. As to the allegations in paragraph 29 of the Complaint that relate to another defendant, Experian does not have knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of those allegations and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation of paragraph 29 of the Complaint.
- 30. In response to paragraph 30 of the Complaint, Experian denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein that relates to Experian. As to the allegations in paragraph 30 of the Complaint that relate to the other defendants, Experian does not have knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of those allegations and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation of paragraph 30 of the Complaint.
- 31. In response to paragraph 31 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.

32. In response to paragraph 32 of the Complaint, Experian denies, generally and specifically, that it issued an improper or inaccurate report. As to the remaining allegations in paragraph 32 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation contained therein.

- 33. In response to paragraph 33 of the Complaint, Experian denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein that relates to Experian. As to the allegations in paragraph 33 of the Complaint that relate to another defendant, Experian does not have knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of those allegations and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation of paragraph 33 of the Complaint.
- 34. In response to paragraph 34 of the Complaint, Experian denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein that relates to Experian. As to the allegations in paragraph 34 of the Complaint that relate to the other defendants, Experian does not have knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of those allegations and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation of paragraph 34 of the Complaint.
- 35. In response to paragraph 35 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.

36. In response to paragraph 36 of the Complaint, Experian states that this paragraph calls for speculation and, accordingly, does not require a response from Experian. To the extent that a denial or admission is required, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in paragraph 36 and, on that basis, denies generally and specifically, each and every allegation therein.

- 37. In response to paragraph 37 of the Complaint, Experian denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein that relates to Experian. As to the allegations in paragraph 37 of the Complaint that relate to another defendant, Experian does not have knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of those allegations and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation of paragraph 37 of the Complaint.
- 38. In response to paragraph 38 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.
- 39. In response to paragraph 39 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.
- 40. In response to paragraph 40 of the Complaint, Experian denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein that relates to Experian. As

to the allegations in paragraph 40 of the Complaint that relate to another defendant, Experian does not have knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of those allegations and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation of paragraph 40 of the Complaint.

- 41. In response to paragraph 41 of the Complaint, Experian denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein that relates to Experian. As to the allegations in paragraph 41 of the Complaint that relate to another defendant, Experian does not have knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of those allegations and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation of paragraph 41 of the Complaint.
- 42. In response to paragraph 42 of the Complaint, Experian denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein that relates to Experian. As to the allegations in paragraph 42 of the Complaint that relate to the other defendants, Experian does not have knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of those allegations and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation of paragraph 42 of the Complaint.
- 43. In response to paragraph 43 of the Complaint, Experian denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein that relates to Experian. As to the allegations in paragraph 43 of the Complaint that relate to the other defendants, Experian does not have knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of those allegations and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation of paragraph 43 of the Complaint.

44. In response to paragraph 44 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.

45. In response to paragraph 45 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.

46. In response to paragraph 46 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.

- 47. In response to paragraph 47 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.
- 48. In response to paragraph 48 of the Complaint, Experian denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein that relates to Experian. As to the allegations in paragraph 48 of the Complaint that relate to the other defendants, Experian does not have knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of those allegations and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation of paragraph 48 of the Complaint.

- 49. In response to paragraph 49 of the Complaint, Experian denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein that relates to Experian. As to the allegations in paragraph 49 of the Complaint that relate to the other defendants, Experian does not have knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of those allegations and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation of paragraph 49 of the Complaint.
- 50. In response to paragraph 50 of the Complaint, Experian denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein that relates to Experian. As to the allegations in paragraph 50 of the Complaint that relate to the other defendants, Experian does not have knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of those allegations and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation of paragraph 50 of the Complaint.
- 51. In response to paragraph 51 of the Complaint, Experian denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein that relates to Experian. As to the allegations in paragraph 51 of the Complaint that relate to the other defendants, Experian does not have knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of those allegations and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation of paragraph 51 of the Complaint.
- 52. In response to paragraph 52 of the Complaint, Experian denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein that relates to Experian. As to the allegations in paragraph 52 of the Complaint that relate to another defendant, Experian does not have knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the

truth of those allegations and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation of paragraph 52 of the Complaint.

- 53. In response to paragraph 53 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.
- 54. In response to paragraph 54 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.
- 55. In response to paragraph 55 of the Complaint, Experian denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein that relates to Experian. As to the allegations in paragraph 55 of the Complaint that relate to another defendant, Experian does not have knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of those allegations and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation of paragraph 55 of the Complaint.
- 56. In response to paragraph 56 of the Complaint, Experian denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein that relates to Experian. As to the allegations in paragraph 56 of the Complaint that relate to the other defendants, Experian does not have knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of those allegations and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation of paragraph 56 of the Complaint.

- 57. In response to paragraph 57 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.
- 58. In response to paragraph 58 of the Complaint Experian denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein that relates to Experian. As to the allegations in paragraph 58 of the Complaint that relate to another defendant, Experian does not have knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of those allegations and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation of paragraph 58 of the Complaint.
- 59. In response to paragraph 59 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.
- 60. In response to paragraph 60 of the Complaint Experian denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein that relates to Experian. As to the allegations in paragraph 60 of the Complaint that relate to the other defendants, Experian does not have knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of those allegations and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation of paragraph 60 of the Complaint.
- 61. In response to paragraph 61 of the Complaint Experian denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein that relates to Experian.

Experian denies that Plaintiff is entitled to any relief from Experian. As to the allegations in paragraph 61 of the Complaint that relate to the other defendants, Experian does not have knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of those allegations and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation of paragraph 61 of the Complaint.

COUNT I

VIOLATIONS OF THE FAIR DEBT COLLECTION PRACTICES ACT 15 U.S.C. § 1692 et seq.

- 62. In response to paragraph 62 of the Complaint, Experian incorporates by reference its responses to paragraphs 1 through 61.
- 63. In response to paragraph 63 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein, including all subparts.
- 64. In response to paragraph 64 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein. Further, Experian denies Plaintiff is entitled to any of the relief set forth in the paragraph beginning with "WHEREFORE," following paragraph 64.

COUNT II

VIOLATIONS OF THE FAIR CREDIT REPORTING ACT 15 U.S.C. § 1681 et seq.

- 65. In response to paragraph 65 of the Complaint, Experian incorporates by reference its responses to paragraphs 1 through 64.
- 66. In response to paragraph 66 of the Complaint, Experian admits that it is a consumer reporting agency as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1681a(f). As to the allegations in paragraph 66 of the Complaint that relate to another defendant, Experian does not have knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of those allegations and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation of paragraph 66 of the Complaint.
- 67. In response to paragraph 67 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.
- 68. In response to paragraph 68 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.
- 69. In response to paragraph 69 of the Complaint, Experian denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein that relates to Experian. As to the allegations in paragraph 69 of the Complaint that relate to another defendant,

Experian does not have knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of those allegations and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation of paragraph 69 of the Complaint.

- 70. In response to paragraph 70 of the Complaint, Experian denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein that relates to Experian. As to the allegations in paragraph 70 of the Complaint that relate to another defendant, Experian does not have knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of those allegations and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation of paragraph 70 of the Complaint.
- 71. In response to paragraph 71 of the Complaint, Experian denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein that relates to Experian. As to the allegations in paragraph 71 of the Complaint that relate to the other defendants, Experian does not have knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of those allegations and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation of paragraph 71 of the Complaint.
- 72. In response to paragraph 72 of the Complaint, Experian denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein that relates to Experian. As to the allegations in paragraph 72 of the Complaint that relate to the other defendants, Experian does not have knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of those allegations and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation of paragraph 72 of the Complaint.

73. In response to paragraph 73 of the Complaint, Experian denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein that relates to Experian. As to the allegations in paragraph 73 of the Complaint that relate to the other defendants, Experian does not have knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of those allegations and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation of paragraph 73 of the Complaint. Further, Experian denies Plaintiff is entitled to any of the relief set forth in the paragraph beginning with "WHEREFORE," following paragraph 73.

COUNT III

DEFAMATION

- 74. In response to paragraph 74 of the Complaint, Experian incorporates by reference its responses to paragraphs 1 through 73.
- 75. In response to paragraph 75 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.
- 76. In response to paragraph 76 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.
- 77. In response to paragraph 77 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations

contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.

78. In response to paragraph 78 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein. Further, Experian denies Plaintiff is entitled to any of the relief set forth in the paragraph beginning with "WHEREFORE," following paragraph 78.

COUNT IV

INVASION OF PRIVACY

- 79. In response to paragraph 79 of the Complaint, Experian incorporates by reference its responses to paragraphs 1 through 78.
- 80. In response to paragraph 80 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.
- 81. In response to paragraph 81 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein. Further, Experian denies Plaintiff is entitled to any of the relief set forth in the paragraph beginning with "WHEREFORE," following paragraph 81.

COUNT V

NEGLIGENT, RECKLESS, WANTON, MALICIOUS AND/OR INTENTIONAL CONDUCT

- 82. In response to paragraph 82 of the Complaint, Experian incorporates by reference its responses to paragraphs 1 through 81.
- 83. In response to paragraph 83 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.
- 84. In response to paragraph 84 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.
- 85. In response to paragraph 85 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.
- 86. In response to paragraph 86 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.

87. In response to paragraph 87 of the Complaint, Experian is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained therein and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein.

88. In response to paragraph 88 of the Complaint, Experian denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein that relates to Experian. As to the allegations in paragraph 88 of the Complaint that relate to another defendant, Experian does not have knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of those allegations and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation of paragraph 88 of the Complaint.

89. In response to paragraph 89 of the Complaint, Experian denies, generally and specifically, each and every allegation contained therein that relates to Experian. As to the allegations in paragraph 89 of the Complaint that relate to the other defendants, Experian does not have knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of those allegations and, on that basis, denies, generally and specifically, each and every remaining allegation of paragraph 89 of the Complaint. Further, Experian denies Plaintiff is entitled to any of the relief set forth in the paragraph beginning with "WHEREFORE," following paragraph 89.

DEMAND FOR A JURY TRIAL

Experian admits that Plaintiff has demanded a trial by jury. Experian states that this is a legal conclusion which is not subject to denial or admission.

AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES

FIRST AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

The Complaint fails to set forth facts sufficient to state a claim upon which relief may be granted against Experian and fails to state facts sufficient to entitle Plaintiff to the relief sought, or to any other relief from Experian.

SECOND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

All claims against Experian are barred by the qualified immunity of 15 U.S.C. § 1681h(e).

THIRD AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

All claims against Experian are barred because all information Experian communicated to any third person regarding Plaintiff was true.

FOURTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Experian is informed and believes and thereon alleges that any purported damages allegedly suffered by Plaintiff are the results of the acts or omissions of third persons over whom Experian had neither control nor responsibility.

FIFTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiff has failed to mitigate her damages.

SIXTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

The Complaint and each claim for relief therein is barred by laches.

SEVENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Experian is informed and believes and thereon alleges that any alleged damages sustained by Plaintiff were, at least in part, caused by the actions of Plaintiff herself and

resulted from Plaintiff's own negligence which equaled or exceeded any alleged negligence or wrongdoing by Experian.

EIGHTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Any damages which Plaintiff may have suffered, which Experian continues to deny, were the direct and proximate result of the conduct of Plaintiff. Therefore, Plaintiff is estopped and barred from recovery of any damages.

NINTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Experian is informed and believes and thereon alleges that all or some claims for relief in the Complaint are barred by the applicable statutes of limitation, including, but not limited to, 15 U.S.C. § 1681p.

TENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

The Complaint, and each claim for relief therein that seeks equitable relief, is barred by the doctrine of unclean hands.

ELEVENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Any recovery by Plaintiff is barred, in whole or in part, under the principles of setoff and recoupment for damages or settlement amounts recovered from others.

TWELFTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiff's alleged damages were not caused by Experian, but by an independent intervening cause.

THIRTEENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Experian did not act with malice or willful intent toward Plaintiff but rather acted in good faith at all times in its dealings with her.

FOURTEENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

In the event that a settlement is reached between Plaintiff and any other party, Experian is entitled to any settlement credits permitted by law.

FIFTEENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiff's state law claims are preempted to the extent they are inconsistent with the Fair Credit Reporting Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1681 et. seq. ("FCRA"). Experian's conduct is governed by the Fair Credit Reporting Act and Experian acted at all times in compliance with the Fair Credit Reporting Act.

SIXTEENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiff's claims are barred by the privileges and immunity afforded Experian by the FCRA and by common law, including but not limited to qualified privilege and immunity, conditional privilege and immunity, and/or absolute privilege and immunity.

SEVENTEENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiff's claims for exemplary or punitive damages violate the Fourteenth Amendment, the excessive fines clause of the Eighth Amendment, and the Due Process Clause of the United States Constitution, and violate the Constitution and laws of Alabama.

EIGHTEENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

An assessment of punitive damages in this action is unconstitutional as to Experian and as applied to the acts and circumstances in this case in that:

- (a) It operates to create an arbitrary and capricious method and manner for the jury's assessment in determination of damages, without regard for the quality and quantity of culpability of other defendants joined in one action;
- (b) It operates to deny to Experian a fair opportunity to have the jury assess damages based on Experian's alleged culpability for negligence which cannot be segregated from allegations of negligence against other defendants joined in this action;
- (c) In failing to provide for joint contribution and an apportionment of damages among defendants, it deprives Experian of property without due process of law and contrary to the Fifth and Fourteenth Amendments to the Constitution of the United States and specifically to those portions thereof proscribing any state from depriving any person of property without due process of law;
- (d) In failing to provide for joint contribution and an apportionment of damages among defendants, it deprives Experian of property without due process of law contrary to Article I, Section 6 of the Constitution of the State of Alabama which provides, insofar as are germane, that no person shall be deprived of property except by due process of law.
- (e) An award of punitive damages in this case against Experian would be unconstitutional for the reason that awards of punitive damages are not governed by any specific standards, are not based on rational distinctions, do not serve any legitimate state interest and thereby violate the due process and equal protection provisions of both the Fourteenth Amendment to the United States Constitution and Article I, Sections 1, 6, and 22 of the Constitution of Alabama.

(f) Any demand for punitive damages violates the Sixth Amendment of the United States Constitution in that such claim for punitive damages is a claim that is penal in nature, entitling Experian to the same procedural safeguards accorded to a criminal defendant under the Sixth Amendment.

(g) Any demand for punitive damages violates the self-incrimination clause of the Fifth Amendment of the United States Constitution in that the damages claimed are penal in nature while Experian is required to disclose documents and/or other evidence without the safeguard against self-incrimination set out in the Fifth Amendment.

- (h) Any demand for punitive damages violates the Fifth Amendment of the United States Constitution which prohibits deprivation of life, liberty or property except by due process of law in that the claim for punitive damages is vague and not rationally related to any legitimate government interests.
- (i) Any demand for punitive damages violates the rights guaranteed by the United States Constitution in that the claim for punitive damages is penal in nature for which the burden of proof on Plaintiff is less than the "reasonable doubt" standard required in criminal cases.
- (j) Any demand for punitive damages is unconstitutional under the Constitution of the State of Alabama which provides in Article I, Section 6, that no person shall be deprived of life, liberty or property except by due process of law, in that the punitive damages claimed are vague and not rationally related to any legitimate government interests.

- (k) Any demand for punitive damages is unconstitutional under the Constitution of the State of Alabama, Section 6, which provides that no person shall be deprived of life, liberty, or property except by due process of law, in that the punitive damages claimed are penal in nature, requiring a burden of proof on Plaintiff which is less than the "reasonable doubt" standards applicable in a criminal case.
- (1) Punitive damage awards in Alabama are not governed by any specific standards, are not based upon rational distinctions, and do not serve any legitimate state interest. Consequently, such awards violate the due process and equal protection provisions of both the Fourteenth Amendment of the United States Constitution and Article I, Sections 1, 6, and 22 of the Constitution of the State of Alabama.
- (m) The amount of an award of punitive damages could violate the excessive fines provisions of the Eighth Amendment of the United States Constitution and Article I, Section 15 of the Constitution of the State of Alabama.
- (n) Punitive damages are penal in nature, yet defendants in civil actions are not accorded the same procedural safeguards accorded to criminal defendants under the Fourteenth, Fifteenth, and Sixteenth Amendments to the United States Constitution, including, without limitation, requiring proof beyond a reasonable doubt and imposing civil penal fines in excess of those fines that could be imposed under criminal law.
- (o) Plaintiff's claims for punitive damages are barred or limited by the provisions of Code of Alabama § 6-11-20, et seq. (1975) or any other applicable statutory provision.

NINETEENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Experian adopts and incorporates herein any affirmative defenses asserted by any other defendant to this action.

TWENTIETH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Experian reserves the right to assert additional affirmative defenses as such time and to such extent as warranted by discovery and the factual developments in this case.

WHEREFORE, Defendant Experian Information Solutions, Inc. prays as follows:

- (1) That Plaintiff take nothing by virtue of the Complaint herein and that this action be dismissed in its entirety;
 - (2) For Experian's costs of suit and attorneys' fees herein incurred; and
 - (3) For such other and further relief as the Court may deem just and proper.

Dated: May 26, 2010 Respectfully submitted,

/s/ L. Jackson Young, Jr.

L. Jackson Young, Jr. (ASB-7946-G65L) FERGUSON FROST & DODSON, LLP 2500 Acton Road, Suite 200 Birmingham, Alabama 35243 ljy@ffdlaw.com

Telephone: (205) 380-6984 Facsimile: (205) 380-6986 Attorneys for Defendant

Experian Information Solutions, Inc.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that on this 26th day of May, 2010, I caused the foregoing to be electronically filed with the Clerk of the Court by using the CM/ECF system, which will send a notice of electronic filing to counsel of record.

Wesley L. Phillips, Esq.
PHILLIPS LAW GROUP, LLC
Post Office Box 130488
Birmingham, Alabama 35213
wphillipslaw@gmail.com
Attorney for Plaintiff

Matthew W. Robinett, Esq.
NORMAN, WOOD, KENDRICK &
TURNER
505 20th Street North, Suite 1600
Birmingham, Alabama 35203
mrobinett@nwkt.com
Attorney for Trans Union LLC

Eric B. Langley, Esq.
Marcus R. Chatterton, Esq.
BALCH & BINGHAM LLP
1901 Sixth Avenue North, Suite 1500
Birmingham, Alabama 35203
elangley@balch.com
Attorneys for Midland Funding LLC

/s/ L. Jackson Young, Jr. OF COUNSEL